

ENVIRONMENTAL RISK & PFAS LITIGATION CONFERENCE

The New York City Bar Association | June 17-18, 2025

Odor and Health Effects



Scott Davis, Esq.
Spencer Fane
Dallas, TX



Mike Henderson, Ph.D., CIH Senior Environmental Scientist HETI, Orlando, FL



Vice President
Environmental Claims
Ascot Group, New York, NY



Mary Ann Susavidge

Head of Environmental Bowhead

Specialty Underwriters, Inc.

New York, NY



Odors have existed since the beginning of time. When was the connection between odor and health effects realized?



What are the most common sources of environmental odors, and how do they impact public health, particularly in vulnerable communities?



How effective are current environmental regulations at addressing odor-related complaints, and what gaps exist in enforcement or scientific standards?



When is odor considered a pollutant from a regulatory or state perspective, from an insurance perspective?

Are there any states that have rulings on GL pollution exclusions?



What is the status of odor litigation?



What are the coverage issues under pollution policy?



How are odor related health claims handled by insurance companies?



What mitigations can be implemented to reduce odor related health risks and claims?



ENVIRONMENTAL RISK & PFAS LITIGATION CONFERENCE

The New York City Bar Association | June 17-18, 2025

Odor and Health Effects



Scott Davis, Esq.
Spencer Fane
Dallas, TX



Mike Henderson, Ph.D., CIH Senior Environmental Scientist HETI, Orlando, FL



Vice President
Environmental Claims
Ascot Group, New York, NY



Mary Ann Susavidge

Head of Environmental Bowhead

Specialty Underwriters, Inc.

New York, NY



RESOURCES

Health Impacts of Environmental Odor



- Respiratory Issues coughing, wheezing, chest tightness
- Irritation eye, nose, throat
- Headaches & Nausea common complaints
- Mental Stress anxiety, insomnia
- Gastrointestinal Effects nausea, appetite loss

Sensitive Populations

G

- People respond to odors differently
- Sensitive populations
 - children,
 - elderly,
 - asthmatics,
 - pregnant women

Human Olfactory Sensory Capabilities





Most humans can distinguish more than 5,000 odors



Odor detection can be in the parts-per-trillion range in humans



Approximately 25% of petitions for Public Health Assessments to the US Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry involve odors

Perception and Insurance Implications

G

- Not all odors are toxic, but health complaints still happen
- Perception of risk often drives legal action and insurance claims
- Legal complexity hard to prove/disprove harm
- Common culprits in claims:
 - Mold odors
 - Sewer gas
 - VOCs (e.g., formaldehyde)
- Insurance risk Health-related odor claims can span property, liability, and environmental policies

Sources of Environmental Odors



- Animals Confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs)
- Agricultural Manure and chemical fertilizers or pesticides
- Human Activities Compost, sewage, garbage, fires, household cleaning agents
- Industries Oil refineries, paper mills, wastewater treatment plants
- Nature Moist soil, gardens, fires
- Vehicles Diesel exhaust

Property Value and Real Estate Considerations



- Property values can be impacted by environmental contamination, including odors
- Odors can result in impact legally in lawsuits impacting property values and permanent nuisance (Powell v. Tosh)
- \$500 Million lawsuits (<u>Smithfield Settles Suits Over North</u>
 <u>Carolina Farms, After Losing Appeal</u>)
- Cat odor deemed a physical loss under home owner policy since the odor changed the condition of the property (*Mellin v. N. Sec. Ins. Co., Inc.*, No. 2014-020, 2015 N.H. LEXIS 32 (Apr. 24, 2015)).

Are Odors Pollution(?)



- South Carolina found pollution exclusion in general liability did not cover persistent odors from sewage odors (https://www.youngmoorelaw.com/blog/pollution-exclusion-bars-coverage-for-claims-alleging-harm-from-foul-odors/)
- Odors from Swine CAFO were not considered as pollutant since manure was used as a nutrient (<u>Not Everything is a</u> <u>Pollutant: A Summary of Recent Cases Supporting a Common</u> <u>Sense and Narrow Interpretation of the CGL's Pollution</u> <u>Exclusion</u>)

References



Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR). Are Environmental Odors Toxic. 2017. https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/media/pdfs/2024/11/Are Environmental Odors Toxic 508.pdf

New Hampshire Department of Environmental Services. Odors and Your Health. 2020.

Cone JE, Shusterman D. Health effects of indoor odorants. Environ Health Perspect. 1991 Nov;95:53-9. doi: 10.1289/ehp.919553. PMID: 1821378; PMCID: PMC1568400.

Jackson D, Rosales-Guevara L, Blake R. Environmental odors web site: providing communities and health officials with the tools to address odor issues. J Environ Health. 2014 Nov;77(4):38-9. PMID: 25603622; PMCID: PMC4561993.

https://www.des.nh.gov/sites/g/files/ehbemt341/files/documents/2020-01/ard-ehp-24.pdf

https://accountingbyte.com/impact-of-environmental-pollution-on-property-values/

Not Everything is a Pollutant: A Summary of Recent Cases Supporting a Common Sense and Narrow Interpretation of the CGL's Pollution Exclusion

https://www.agriculture.com/news/livestock/smithfield-settles-suits-over-north-carolina-farms-after-losing-appeal